



STAFF REPORT

CITY of YORBA LINDA

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

DATE: MAY 11, 2022

TO: HONORABLE CHAIRMAN AND MEMBERS OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

FROM: DAVID BRANTLEY, AICP
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

BY: GREG REHMER, SENIOR PLANNER

SUBJECT: CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 2021-46 & DESIGN REVIEW 2021-17

APPLICANT: THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS
50 E. North Temple Street
Salt Lake City, UT 84150

CEQA STATUS: Categorical Exemption(s) (Class 2, Replacement or Reconstruction; Class 32, In-Fill Development; and common sense exemption in 14 Cal. Code Regs. § 15061(b)(3))

RELATED ITEMS: Conditional Use Permit 83-25
Tentative Parcel Map 83-1082
Design Review 84-26

LOCATION: 17130 Bastanchury Road

REQUEST: To redevelop an existing religious facility located on 5.4 (gross) acres of property (5.05 net acres factoring out the horse trail easements and parkway along Osmund Street) at the southwest corner of Bastanchury Road and Osmund Street, addressed as 17130 Bastanchury Road, with a new 29,842 square foot "Temple" split between a basement, the primary main floor, and a mechanical penthouse. The proposed new Temple will include two instruction rooms with 42 seats each, two waiting rooms and a lobby totaling 64 seats, a 42-seat training room, two sealing/marriage rooms totaling 59 seats, a 30-seat baptistry, and a number of ancillary rooms/areas that support the function(s) of the primary rooms, along with associated parking and landscaping improvements. Also being requested for approval is a fifty-seven (57) foot tall steeple with a seven (7) foot finial on top creating a total height of ninety-nine-feet-four-inches (99'-4"), which exceeds the maximum allowable height of forty-five (45) feet for religious symbols on property located within the RE (Residential Estate) zone.

PROJECT DATA

APN: 334-212-04
General Plan: Medium-Low Density Residential
Zoning: RE (Residential Estate)

Property Development Standards:
RE (Residential Estate) standards

	Required	Proposed
Lot area	15,000 sq/ft	5.4 areas (gross)
Front setback	30 feet	71 feet
Left side (east) setback	20 feet	64 feet
Right side (west) setback	20 feet	145 feet
Rear setback	25 feet	345 feet
Building height	45 feet*	99'-4"***
Lot coverage	35% (max)	9%
Parking	107 spaces***	174 spaces

* This height takes into consideration of the additional height allowed for religious symbols pursuant to Section 18.24.119.B of the YLMC.

** The applicants are requesting approval of a Conditional Use Permit to accommodate the proposed steeple and finial height.

*** required parking is based on total seat capacity within the entire Temple building.

BACKGROUND

The Planning Commission approved the initial development of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints (LDS) facility, located at the southwest corner of Bastanchury Road and Osmond Street, on July 27, 1983, under Conditional Use Permit 83-25. The site planning and architectural review was approved on November 28, 1984, under Design Review 84-26. The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints is now requesting to redevelop the site with a new 29,842 square foot “Temple” split between a basement, the primary main floor, and a mechanical penthouse.

As required by Section 18.10.080 and Section 18.36.100 of the Yorba Linda Zoning Code, conditional use permit and design review approvals are required for the re-construction or expansion of a religious facility within a residential zone. Further, Table 18.10-2 of the Yorba Linda Zoning Code states steeples, crosses and other religious symbols on churches and religious institutions may exceed the required height limit for the zone, above the additional allowed ten (10) feet (45-foot maximum height in this case), as determined by the Planning Commission through a conditional use permit application. Therefore, the applicant has submitted Conditional Use Permit 2021-46 and Design Review 2021-17 for the Planning Commission’s review and approval.

DISCUSSION

As indicated above, the applicant is proposing to demolish their existing 15,000 square foot church/meeting house building and construct a new 29,842 square foot “Temple” on the same site. The proposed temple has a main level (ground level) where all temple patron activities occur with a structure footprint of 22,896 square feet. The building also includes a small basement and upper level for mechanical and maintenance services. The primary building mass is set at thirty-five (35) feet tall, which meets the height requirements for the RE (Residential Estate) zone. However, as proposed the temple will also include a fifty-seven (57) foot tall steeple, that will be seventeen (17) wide at the lower portion to twelve (12) feet wide at the upper portion, with a seven (7) foot tall finial on top, creating a total height of ninety-nine-feet-four-inches (99’-4”). The façade and steeple will be externally lit at night from a half hour before to a half hour after operating hours. The main level (ground level) will include two instruction rooms with 42 seats each, two waiting rooms and a lobby totaling 64 seats, a 42-seat training room, two sealing/marriage rooms totaling 59 seats, a 30-seat baptistry, and a number of ancillary rooms/areas that support the function(s) of the primary rooms, along with associated parking and landscaping improvements. The entire facility will have a total of roughly 320 seats throughout the building (this includes all seats associated with the functions of the Temple, including staff offices and other staff dedicated rooms). However, occupancy levels vary throughout the day. Employees work in different shifts where the peak overlap of Temple staff is approximately 50 people. Patrons come and go throughout the day with an average peak time of about 200 patrons in the building spread throughout the various rooms/uses.

The operational characteristics of an LDS “Temple” are different from other religious facilities. The Temple is a place for individual worship rather than group worship. Temples are not open on the Sabbath, so that members may attend their local congregations. A Temple is used by Church members in good standing for sacred ceremonies, including marriage (or “sealing), baptisms, instructional ceremonies followed by informal group gatherings, and individual meditation. The religious instruction within the temple functions on a set schedule. Members currently make appointments online to participate in the different functions. Temple staff assist and guide patrons through the different functions. Each function operates at different times/intervals which creates a controlled flow of people into and out of the building each hour based on the scheduling limitations and room capacities. This is different from a meetinghouse which has larger congregations of people coming all at once for a single service and then leaving all at the same time. Individuals and families can set up appointments to visit the temple. Meetinghouses hold services for a geographical area with services at a set time for the whole geographical area. Meetinghouses also host social events such as receptions which do not occur in the Temple or on Temple grounds.

According to the applicant’s narrative (please see attached) the facility will be open to members, by appointment, between the hours of 6:30 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. Tuesday through Saturday. Although activities will occur throughout the day, it is anticipated that Friday evenings and Saturday mornings will be the busiest times for the Temple activities.

Additional aspects of the proposed project that relate to building architecture and landscaping are discussed in the Design Review section of this staff report.

Parking

Section 18.44 (Off-Street Parking) of the Yorba Linda Zoning Code requires a church facility to provide a minimum of one parking space for each three seats (1:3) within the church's main assembly room (i.e., sanctuary), or one space for each 30 square feet in the main assembly room. However, given the uniqueness of the Temple (i.e., it does not hold congregational services), staff has evaluated parking on the total seating capacity for the entire facility. The facility has a total seating capacity of 365 seats, which includes all rooms used by church members/guests and staff, therefore based on this criterion, the proposed facility, at maximum seating capacity, is required to provide a minimum of 122 parking spaces (i.e. 364 seats divided by 3 = 121.3). The applicant is providing a total of 172 parking spaces. As the parking provided is fifty (50) spaces greater than the number of spaces required by Code, staff is satisfied that the number of spaces provided is sufficient to accommodate the proposed use.

The City Traffic Commission and Traffic Engineer have reviewed the applicant's parking lot design and have not expressed any concern regarding the proposed drive aisle widths, parking lot configuration, or the number spaces provided.

Traffic Commission Review

In compliance with Resolution No. 2010-4065 adopted by the City Council March 2, 2010, which requires the Traffic Commission to act as an advisory body to the Planning Commission and/or City Council for a number of land use entitlements, including a project that could impact traffic patterns, the project was forwarded to the Traffic Commission for review. A Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) was prepared for the project to evaluate traffic related and parking impacts, which was forwarded to the Traffic Commission for consideration.

The project was presented to the Traffic Commission at their regularly scheduled meeting of April 28, 2022. The Traffic Commission considered the staff report (attached) pertaining to the Traffic Engineer and Traffic Consultant's findings regarding potential traffic, circulation, and parking impacts, the (attached) TIA (Traffic Impact Analysis), as well as all public testimony received at the meeting. The consensus of the Traffic Commission was that, as proposed, the project would not cause significant impacts to the existing traffic, parking, and circulation within the area provided that suggested conditions of approval were imposed on the project, which include the following:

- Prior to submittal of any grading permit, the applicant shall prepare and submit a Traffic Management Plan (TMP) that incorporates proposed parking restrictions on Osmond, Rosebud, and any other streets within a 500 feet radius. The TMP shall also include all scenarios for Planned and Unplanned special events and how parking and traffic control will be implemented so as to not impact surrounding neighborhoods. The TMP shall be submitted to the City Engineer and Traffic Commission for review and approval prior to the issuance of any building permit for the new Temple project construction. Approval of the TMP by the Traffic Commission shall occur at least a minimum of one month prior to first planned event and well-coordinated with the City on Traffic Commission's regularly scheduled

meetings and also allowing adequate time (minimum 2 weeks each) for City reviews leading up to the scheduled Traffic Commission meeting. The TMP shall outline the initial circulation management measures outlined in the Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) as well as circulation scenarios to be reviewed once the project is operational, including on-site circulation, Level of Service, and vehicle queues exiting and entering the project site driveway during peak periods. The TMP shall be monitored and updated by the applicant's traffic engineering consultant at intervals of one month, six months, and twelve months after project opening. The applicant's traffic engineer's updated TMP report will be reviewed by the City Engineer to determine if additional traffic mitigation measures shall be implemented by the applicant based on observed impacts. The project applicant shall take immediate actions, upon the request of the City, to address any traffic, parking, and safety issues caused by the project traffic within public right-of-way. Any mitigation measures, as identified by the City Engineer, shall be implemented and funded by the applicant/property owner.

- The Church/property owner shall make best efforts to discourage patrons/guests and employees from parking on adjacent neighborhood streets (i.e., Osmond Street and Rosebud Drive). If best efforts by the church/property owner do not adequately discourage parking on the adjacent streets, as determined by the City Engineer, the applicant shall pay for all costs required to alleviate the parking impacts, which may include, but not limited to, signage, red curbing, and/or implementation of a Permit Parking Program.
- Prior to issuance of Certificate of Occupancy, applicant shall install two-way left turn lane along Bastanchury Road and incidental paving and striping improvements to the satisfaction of the City Engineer. In addition, the applicant shall provide a striped "Keep Clear" zone for the section of roadway along Bastanchury Road in front of the Osmond Street exit onto Bastanchury Road. The "Keep Clear" zone shall be installed Prior to the final sign-off of the building permits. Appropriate C.V.C. signage shall be posted to allow for police enforcement of this provision. The manner of implementation of the "Keep Clear" zone and C.V.C signage shall be reviewed and approved by the City Engineer.
- Prior to submittal of encroachment permit, the applicant/property owner shall evaluate ingress/egress from the Church property onto Bastanchury Road, including a sight distance analysis to be approved by the City Engineer. If determined necessary by the City Engineer at any point after project opening/implementation, the applicant/property owner shall install a dedicated right turn lane along Bastanchury Road on the west side of the project access driveway to streamline traffic ingress/egress.

The Traffic Commission further asked that the applicant prepare the following additional studies prior to Planning Commission review:

- Provide a trip generation analysis for Newport Beach and Redlands Temples as comparable metrics for the proposed project.
 - The study for the Newport Beach facility has been completed and the report shows (please see attached) that the trip generation of that facility is slightly higher (by 10 trips) than what had been evaluated in the original TIA for the Yorba Linda Temple. The City Traffic Engineer has reviewed the revised study and does not have any concerns since the project's Saturday peak hour trip generation was analyzed within the original TIA report. The applicant will provide a report on the Redlands facility during their presentation at the May 11, 2022, Planning Commission hearing.
- Provide an ICE (Intersection Control Evaluation) analysis for the Osmond Street and Bastanchury Road intersection compared against CA-MUTCD Peak Hour Warrant analysis.
 - The analysis has been prepared and is attached to this report. Based on the findings staff has no concerns.
- Provide a Synchro operational analysis for Osmond and Bastanchury Road to simulate traffic conditions with a two way left turn lane option at the intersection.

- The analysis has been prepared and is attached to this report. Based on the findings staff has no concerns.

The Traffic Commission took action to support the project with recommended additional studies and recommended conditions of approval as noted above.

Other issues of consideration discussed by the Traffic Commission included:

- Consideration of Dark Sky limitations.
 - The City does not have a dark sky ordinance; therefore, the City cannot impose additional restrictions on the project related to that issue.
- Further details of the proposed open house.
 - It was mentioned during the Traffic Commission that the Newport Beach facility had 30,000 individuals visiting the site every day during the open house event. However, according to the applicant this was not accurate and they will be providing empirical evidence of the actual attendance for most of their open house events in their presentation to the Planning Commission on May 11, 2022.
- The Traffic Commission suggested that noticing for the project should extend beyond what is required by State requirements for public hearing items.
 - The City Council at their regularly scheduled meeting of April 5, 2022, discussed this issue and requested that the project applicant consider increasing the required public notice from 300 feet to 500 feet. The applicant agreed to noticing at a 500' radius. Staff believes that the extended noticing radius is adequate and would not recommend that noticing beyond the already extended radius distance be required.

Grading and Drainage

Since existing topography of the project site is relatively flat, only minor grading is necessary to construct the onsite improvements, including the new parking area, driveway access, and new Temple construction. As proposed the pad area where the new Temple will be constructed will be graded about two (2) feet higher to allow proper drainage and water flow from the site. The lower southern portion of the property (i.e., the baseball field) will include import of soil to bring that portion of the property close to grade level of the church ground and surrounding properties. This portion of the property will be regraded to raise the area between two (2) to eight (8) feet above current pad levels in order to allow proper drainage and water flow from the site, and to create pedestrian access from the parking area to the new Temple building. The existing trails along the southern and western boundaries of the site will not be regraded or affected by the proposed grading design, nor will the site-grade adjacent to the trail exceed the grade of the trail.

Once completed, all on-site water will be directed to public storm drains or detention basins in accordance with State Water Quality Guidelines. Staff has not identified significant grading or drainage issues relative to the proposed project and has included standard Conditions of Approval in the attached Resolution for Conditional Use Permit 2021-46.

Surrounding Land Use

As previously noted, the project area is located at the southwest corner of Bastanchury Road and Osmond Street. Single-family homes immediately border the project site on the south,

west, and east (across Osmond Street) sides. To the north, across Bastanchury Road, is the Friendship Baptist Church facility. In review of the plans, the closest residence is located greater than 180 feet from the new Temple building, which would be the north resident on the east side of Osmond Street. The closest resident to the west (on Rosebud Drive) is over 200 feet away and the closest resident to the south (on La Serena Drive) is over 410 feet from the new Temple building.

DESIGN REVIEW 2012-07

Building Architecture

The proposed new Temple will consist of white polished marble exterior, clay tile roof, decorative archways with decorative stone carved inlays, aluminum bandings and finial at the top of the steeple, pronounced entries that include additional carved stone elements and accents. Majority of the site will be enclosed with a decorative six (6) foot tall wrought iron fence. Staff believes the proposed building design is attractive and will enhance the surrounding community. Staff has no additional concerns and supports the building architecture as proposed.

Landscaping

The landscape plan depicts significant landscaping existing along the south, west, and east edges of the project site in an effort to screen these adjacent property owners from activities associated with the existing church facility. Staff visited the site and counted at least twenty (20) tall trees (mostly protected eucalyptus trees) along the southern boundary of the site (on the south side of the existing horse trail), eighteen (18) trees along the Osmond Street frontage (between the existing wrought-iron fence and the street right-of-way), and thirty-four (34) trees along the western boundary of the site. In addition to the existing landscaping, the preliminary landscape plan prepared for the project depicts the addition of 197 new trees onsite that would surround the proposed Temple building and locate within the new parking area to the south. According to the landscape plan, there will be a total of at least fifteen (25) different types of accent trees proposed throughout the project site. Additionally, as stated above, most, if not all of the existing trees along the south, west, and east boundaries of the site that abut/interface with the surrounding single-family residential properties will remain intact.

Staff believes the additional landscaping proposed would enhance the appearance of the site, and would provide additional visual buffer of the proposed new Temple building, parking lots, and site lighting as viewed from Osmond Street and surrounding properties to the south and west. However, staff would recommend including a condition of approval requiring the applicant to submit final landscape plans for review and approval of the Community Development Director and the City Landscape Architect.

It should be noted that along the southern and western boundaries of the site there is a fifteen foot (15') wide equestrian easement that provides an additional buffer between these residential properties and the church property.

Exterior Lighting

The exterior of the Temple facility is proposed to be lighted. The Temple's exterior lighting system includes the following illumination categories: landscape elements, the building façade, the steeple, parking lot lighting, pedestrian pathways and property perimeters, and security lighting. All lighting fixtures will be aimed to illuminate only the landscape, parking area, and architectural surfaces, thus eliminating light spillage onto adjacent properties and reducing light pollution into the sky. Lighting of the Temple is proposed thirty (30) minutes prior to church opening and thirty (30) after church closing. No additional lighting of the site is proposed, except for security purposes, parking lot lighting. Security level lighting within the parking lot is low-level and would not create any glare or other disturbance condition. Moreover, the proposed lighting of the building will be indirect (not internal), and is intended to be contemplative, and tasteful.

A photometric analysis of the proposed lighting has been provided. According to the analysis, lighting will not intrude onto any adjacent neighboring properties. In fact, illumination levels are expected to be no more than 0.1 footcandles at the neighboring residential property boundaries, which is below code allowance of 0.2 footcandle. Nevertheless, staff has added a standard condition of approval (#84) requiring that lighting levels on neighboring properties not exceed 0.2 footcandle, the maximum allowable level per City standards. Staff has also conditioned that a post construction photometric study be conducted and provided to the City to confirm that no light or glare spills onto any adjacent property. Therefore, with the added condition of approval staff has no additional concerns related to lighting.

OPPOSITION EMAILS

Conditional Use Permit 2021-46 & Design Review 2021-17 has been opposed by a couple of property owners immediately adjacent to the project site. The emails submitted expressed concerns related to traffic, parking on Osmond Street, the steeple height, building timeline and impact to owls in neighboring trees. In response, staff would direct the Planning Commission to the attached conditions of approval and Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA). Conditions of approval have been added to address the concerns regarding the owls, parking on Osmond Street and other related traffic impacts. Further, The Traffic Commission reviewed the TIA and parking impacts associated with the project, and with the added conditions of approval as noted above, recommended favorably towards the project. Regarding the steeple height, this aspect of the project is at the discretion of the Planning Commission and the applicant has submitted a conditional use permit request for the Planning Commission's consideration. Therefore, staff believes that the concerns expressed in the attached emails, with the exception of the steeple height, have been addressed adequately.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission take the following actions:

1. Adopt a resolution approving Conditional Use Permit 2021-46, with conditions.

2. Approve, by minute motion, Design Review 2021-17, with conditions.

ATTACHMENTS

-
- 1) Plans
 - 2) Locator Map
 - 3) Applicant's Statement of Temple operations dated November 17, 2021, and May 5, 2022.
 - 4) Traffic Commission Staff Report for the April 28, 2022, Traffic Commission meeting
 - 5) Traffic Impact Analysis
 - 6) Memorandum dated May 6, 2022, with the updated traffic impact studies requested by the Traffic Commission.
 - 6) Opposition emails
 - 7) Resolution for Conditional Use Permit 2021-46
 - 8) Exhibit "A" - Conditions of Approval
 - 9) Conditions of Approval for Design Review 2021-17
-